



MINUTES

MINUTES of MEETING of the STIRLING AND CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL JOINT COMMITTEE held in the COUNCIL CHAMBERS, OLD VIEWFORTH, STIRLING and by MICROSOFT TEAMS on THURSDAY 18 APRIL 2024 at 3.00 pm

Present

Councillor Neil Benny, Stirling Council
Councillor Martha Benny, Clackmannanshire Council
Graeme Duff, University of Stirling
Councillor Scott Farmer, Stirling Council
Councillor Ellen Forson, Clackmannanshire Council
Councillor Chris Kane, Stirling Council (in the Chair)
Councillor Janine Rennie, Clackmannanshire Council
Eileen Schofield, University of Stirling
Professor Leigh Sparks, University of Stirling

In Attendance

George Barbour, Executive Office and Communications Service Manager, Stirling Council
Carol Beattie, Chief Executive, Stirling Council
Nikki Bridle, Chief Executive, Clackmannanshire Council
Jane Burridge, Lead Transformation Officer, Clackmannanshire Council
Sally Dimeo, Chief Finance Officer, University of Stirling
Profession Iain Docherty, University of Stirling, Chair of Regional Economic Advisory Group
Nicola Drago Ferrante, Growth Deal Programme Officer, University of Stirling
Claire Farmer, Head of the Regional Programme Management Office
Mark Henderson, Senior Communications Officer, Stirling Council)
Ann Jacob-Chandler, Head of Economic Development, Planning and Climate Change, Stirling Council
Pete Leonard, Strategic Director, Clackmannanshire Council
Steven MacDonald, Economic Growth, Culture, Tourism & Events Service Manager, Stirling Council
Melanie Moore, Committee Services, Clackmannanshire Council
Brian Roberts, Chief Operating Officer- Infrastructure & Environment, Stirling Council
Gillian White, Committee Services, Clackmannanshire Council
David McDougall, Governance Officer, Stirling Council (Clerk)

Recording of Meeting started

Prior to the start of the meeting, Councillor Kane, as Chair of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee, welcomed everyone to the meeting. It was advised that the meeting was being broadcast live via the Public-i portal on the Council's website and that a recording of the meeting would also be made publicly available on the website following the meeting.

Prior to moving onto the business of the meeting, the Chair noted the recent sad death of Dr John Rogers of the University of Stirling. The Chair paid tribute to Dr Rogers' and his significant contribution to the City Region Deal. Thoughts were with Dr Rogers' family and colleagues at this sad time.

CRD25 APOLOGIES AND SUBSTITUTIONS

There were no apologies or substitutions.

CRD26 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest.

CRD27 URGENT BUSINESS

There were no items of urgent business brought forward.

CRD28 MINUTES – STIRLING & CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL JOINT COMMITTEE – 4 MARCH 2024

The Minutes of the Meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee held on 4 March 2024 were submitted for approval.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 4 March 2024 as an accurate record of proceedings.

CRD29 FORWARD PLANNING

(a) JOINT COMMITTEE ROLLING ACTION LOG

The Joint Committee Rolling Action Log was submitted for review.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to note the content of the Rolling Action Log and the closure of those actions recommended for removal.

(b) JOINT COMMITTEE FORWARD PLAN

The Joint Committee forward plan was submitted for review.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to note the content of the Forward Plan.

CRD30 UPDATE FROM REGIONAL ECONOMIC ADVISORY GROUP (REAG)

A presentation was provided by Professor Iain Docherty, University of Stirling, Chair of the Regional Economic Advisory Group (REAG).

The presentation provided information on work to re-invigorate the REAG; an overview of the external economic environment, implications for the Deal programme; and the next steps for REAG and the Deal.

Responding to a query regarding involvement of the private sector in shaping the re-profiling of the Deal, Professor Docherty advised that engagement with the private sector had to be targeted and very clear about expectations in terms of involvement of the private sector in specific projects. Now that they were at the stage where REAG was being rebooted, he felt they would be able to move on to engagement with private sector partners as a matter of urgency.

Professor Docherty noted that he felt now was time to move towards active involvement from the private sector as much as possible, noting that REAG will be able to assist with this private-public collaboration.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to note the content of the presentation.

CRD31 THE NATIONAL TARTAN CENTRE – REVIEW OF THE OUTLINE BUSINESS CASE FINDINGS

The report by the Head of Economic Development, Planning and Climate Change (Stirling Council) provided an update for Joint Committee on the analysis that had been undertaken in consideration of an Outline Business Case for the National Tartan Centre. It highlighted the lack of financial viability of the project, the significant funding gaps associated with capital cost of delivering the project, and the further affordability gaps associated with ongoing operational revenue expenditure for a project of this nature.

Due to the considerable capital and revenue funding gaps, it was not possible to determine a positive business case for this project. Therefore, without significant additional capital and revenue funding, the project was no longer deemed viable.

The report sought approval from Joint Committee to terminate the project, and to progress the necessary Change Request process within the City Region Deal framework with Government to remove the project from the City Region Deal programme. A mechanism would need to be agreed with Government for considering an alternative viable project that achieved agreed aims and objectives of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal.

The Chair noted his thanks to officers for the significant level of work which had been required to get to this point.

Concerns were raised regarding the length of time it had taken to arrive at this conclusion, while queries were raised around the process and timescales for bringing forward alternative options to Joint Committee for consideration and the need for engagement with Joint Committee members as early as possible on the options being considered.

Councillor Farmer requested that he be provided with a note of the costs involved in the work which had been put into the Tartan Centre project up to that point.

Responding to queries, the Chief Operating Officer for Infrastructure and Environment (Stirling Council) advised that it would likely be the second half of the year at the earliest before any alternative options were brought forward to Joint Committee, with initial engagement with Joint Committee members taking place before then. He advised that discussions would need to take place with Government under the change control process regarding any alternative potential projects within the “innovation space”, in order to deliver on the outcomes of the overall Deal.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. note the work undertaken in consideration of the outline business case for the National Tartan Centre;
2. note that the project is unaffordable;
3. agree to remove the project from the City Region Deal programme;
4. agree that a report be brought back to Joint Committee for consideration of alternative project(s), prior to submission to Governments for consideration;
5. agree that a Change Request be submitted to Government to change the project; and
6. agree that a report be brought back to Joint Committee on the outcome of the Change Request process.

(Reference: Report by Head of Economic Development, Planning and Climate Change (Stirling Council), undated, submitted)

CRD32 THE ALLOA INNOVATION CAMPUS CHANGE CONTROL REQUEST

The Chief Executive (Clackmannanshire Council) and Strategic Director (Clackmannanshire Council) presented an overview of the proposals within the report, which set out the case and requested approval for, a formal change control request to be submitted to the UK and Scottish Governments, consolidating Phase 2 of Scotland's International Environment Centre, the Intergenerational Living Innovation Hub, and the Alloa Digital Hub project into a new project under the Innovation Thematic Area: the Alloa Innovation Campus.

The Chair noted that he had no issue with the change request itself but did have concerns regarding the references to the Culture, Heritage and Tourism (CHT) fund and potential unintended consequences of moving funding over between projects. He felt the report didn't adequately explain how these processes would run concurrently in a way which would ensure one didn't adversely impact on the other.

The Chief Executive (Clackmannanshire Council) clarified that there was no change in the overall arrangements and what was being requested was a consolidation rather than a change in projects or amounts. All proposals would still require to have due regard to the existing Deal programme and project governance. The intention was to submit a single proposal for the use of Clacks share of CHT funding to the CHT Board, so that processes were running in parallel rather than sequentially. The Board would still make a recommendation to the Joint Committee which would ultimately take the final decisions.

The University Secretary stated that she felt this request was about setting a strategic direction of travel, noting concerns raised at previous meetings of the Joint Committee regarding the point at which Committee was made aware of proposals. Final details would require further dialogue with both sets of Governments and all governance and business case requirements would need to be satisfied in the usual way.

The Vice-Chair agreed that she felt this was about setting the strategic direction of travel, noting that the report did not seek a decision on the use of the CHT fund but instead set out the direction of travel which Clackmannanshire Council wanted their CHT offer to move in. She understood that initial discussions had taken place with Scottish Government who had indicated that the proposal would still meet outline business case requirements for the CHT fund.

The Chair gave notice of an Amendment, which was shared with the Committee Members.

Committee adjourned briefly to consider the Amendment

Committee re-convened with all Members previously noted present

The Chair advised that following discussions which had taken place during the adjournment, there was agreement on an updated Amendment which he would move and Councillor Farmer would second.

The Amendment was agreed unanimously without the need for a roll call vote.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. note the affordability challenges driving the proposal to consolidate existing projects into the Alloa Innovation Campus project;
2. approve the proposal to consolidate the:
 - a. Intergenerational Living Innovation Hub (ILIH);
 - b. Scotland's International Environment Centre (SIEC) phase 2;
 - c. Clackmannanshire's Digital Hub, and;
 - d. Clackmannanshire's Cultural Heritage and Tourism programme share (subject to the outcome of Programme and project governance and due diligence)within the single Alloa Innovation Campus project;
3. agree that the process to finalise the list of projects within the regional Cultural, Heritage and Tourism programme is concluded and submitted to Government prior to the finalisation of the consolidated business case for the Alloa Innovation Campus project, and in line with the timeline set out in the paper;
4. note that officers are in discussion with the UK and Scottish Governments on whether a change control process is required; and
5. approve that officers submit a change control request to the Governments if required.

(Reference: Report by Head of Regional Programme Management Office, undated, submitted)

CRD33 ANNUAL CONVERSATION WITH SCOTTISH AND UK GOVERNMENTS

The City Region Deal Grant Offer included a mandatory requirement for an Annual Conversation with Scottish and UK Governments each year. The basis for this conversation was the City Region Deal Annual Report for the previous year. Joint Committee was asked to approve the Annual Report and agenda as suitable for use in the Annual Conversation on April 19 2024.

The Head of the RPMO noted a change in the officials in place at both Governments and advised that the focus of this year's conversation would be on building relationships with these new officials to ensure they understood the point the Deal was at and the changes which may be proposed. In addition there was a need to gain a better understanding and clarify the processes around the grant offer process in future.

Decision

The Stirling & Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. note the content of the draft City Region Deal Annual Report for 2023;
2. approve the draft City Region Deal Annual Report for 2023 as suitable for discussion with UK and Scottish Governments for the Annual Conversation on 19 April 2024;
3. agree that a final version of the City Region Deal Annual Report will be submitted to Joint Committee for final approval before being published; and
4. note the areas they wished to be emphasised within the set agenda for the Annual Conversation on 19th April 2024.

(Reference: Report by Head of Regional Programme Management Office, dated 8 April 2024, submitted)

The Chair declared the meeting closed at 4.30pm



Stirling &
Clackmannanshire
City Region Deal