

# Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal – *The Japanese Gardens – Business Justification Case*

Joint Committee – Tuesday the 27<sup>th</sup> of September 2022

Agenda Item 6.2

## **Executive summary**

This paper seeks Joint Committee approval of the Business Justification Case – with the updated Benefit Realisation Plan – for the Japanese Gardens Project. This project is part of the Capital Fund for Clackmannanshire within the City Region Deal.

## **Authors**

Richard Marsh, Director at 4-Consulting

[richard.marsh@4-consulting.com](mailto:richard.marsh@4-consulting.com)

## Recommendations

---

Joint Committee members are asked to:

1. Approve the Business Justification Case (BJC) for the Japanese Gardens with Benefit Realisation Plan, and;
2. Note the activity that has commenced as part of the project.

## Implications

---

None

## Legal & Risk Implications and Mitigation

---

As part of City Region Deal Governance arrangements, approval of the BJC by Joint Committee is required to permit the project to progress to claim funding. The project, which has spent substantially at risk, would be placed at risk if approval were not given.

## Background

---

1. The project, supported via the Capital Fund for Clackmannanshire and with a value of £750,000, intends to restore the historic Japanese Garden at Cowden. The Japanese Garden is part of the City Region Deal's investment in Culture, Heritage & Tourism.
2. The Japanese Garden at Cowden was commissioned by the explorer Ella Christie in 1908 after an inspiring visit to Kyoto. Created by Taki Handa, the only woman credited with the design of a garden of its type.
3. The Japanese Garden was destroyed by vandals in 1963 and it was almost lost forever until a careful restoration project by a charitable trust began in 2014. Due to overwhelming interest the garden opened to visitors while restoration work was in progress.
4. City Region Deal investment is needed to help develop the infrastructure and permanent facilities required for the continued operation of this unique new tourism offer for Clackmannanshire.
5. The BJC for the Japanese Gardens project was approved at the July 2022 meeting of the Joint Committee, subject to further development of the Benefit Realisation Plan (BRP).

## Considerations

---

6. As noted above, the project Business Justification Case (BJC) has been approved, subject to the development of a BRP for the project.
7. The project has spent at risk, with much of the project's activity already undertaken. This has placed a strain on the charity's budgets, whilst also increasing both turnover and visitor numbers to the attraction.
8. The BJC notes the following outputs and outcomes for the Japanese Gardens project:

### Outputs

- Restoration completed, including: the Tea House; gardens and pathways, and; enabling infrastructure.
- Unique high-quality event and exhibition space is created.
- Japanese Garden becomes part of the City Region's Inclusive Skills Ecosystem (linked to organisations including Clackmannanshire Works programme & Forth Valley College).

### Outcomes

- Improved visitor capacity allowing the Japanese Garden to sustain significantly higher visitor numbers and events.
- The Garden will provide opportunities to promote tourism across the city region.
- Volunteering, learning and work experience opportunities.
- A unique cultural and historical asset to be leveraged by organisations across the City Region.

### **Alignment with City Region Deal Outcomes**

9. The BRP, drafted following the July 2022 Joint Committee meeting, provides a more robust framework for the realisation of future benefits, whilst also detailing achievements to date. The main BJC document has not been updated, as both Governments and Joint Committee have approved the principle. The BRP will be supplemental to the BJC and builds on the original content.
10. The BRP makes significant progress in addressing the Strategic Outcomes of the wider Deal Programme and the overarching City Region Deal BRP.
11. Delivery Partners and stakeholders will continue to work with the Japanese Gardens to ensure that alignment with Strategic Outcomes is a key element of future work at the Gardens.

## Resource Implications

---

### Financial Details

The full financial implications of the recommendations are set out in the report. This includes a reference to full life cycle costs where appropriate. Yes

Finance Officers have been consulted and have agreed the financial implications as set out in the report. Yes

### Staffing

The full implications on staffing are set out in the report. Yes

### Exempt Reports

Is this report exempt? Yes

### Equalities Impact

Have you undertaken the required equalities impact assessment to ensure that no groups are adversely affected by the recommendations? Yes

### Legality

It has been confirmed that in adopting the recommendations contained in this report, the Joint Committee is acting within its legal powers. Yes

### Sustainability and Environmental

It has been confirmed that sustainability and environmental issues have been considered within the report. Yes

## Policy Implications

---

None

## Consultations

---

None

## Background Papers

---

Have you used other documents to compile your report?

None

## Appendices

---

Please list any appendices attached to this report. If there are no appendices, please state "none".

1. Japanese Gardens – Business Justification Case
2. Japanese Gardens – Benefit Realisation Plan

## Approved by:

---

Pete Leonard, Strategic Director, Place

[pleonard@clacks.gov.uk](mailto:pleonard@clacks.gov.uk)

# Japanese Garden Benefits Realisation Plan:

## Additional Objectives & Activities

The Japanese Garden objectives and activities are shown in the Benefits Realisation Plan (BRP), appended to the business case. Eight new objectives (1a-8a) and corresponding activities (1b-8b) are shown below.

The new objectives are based on feedback from the CRD Joint Committee and subsequent discussions with the Japanese Garden project team. The new objectives and activities provide a stronger alignment between project and the CRD objectives.

The new objectives and activities are also linked to the CRD objectives alongside the linked objectives and activities already identified in the business case. Most of the objectives described are similar to the corresponding activities<sup>1</sup>.

In addition to the new objectives and activities set out below, the outreach officer will maintain the schools engagement programme offering all schools an opportunity to visit the garden. If schools cannot afford transport, the Japanese Garden has secured funding to help provide transport for pupils.

The project team are beginning to collect monitoring data and tackle the points raised by the joint committee with some key points set out below.

- The senior management (decision-making) team includes the manager with seven people reporting directly to her. The senior management team is currently 75% female. The senior management team promote flexible working and inclusive opportunities, half the senior management team currently work flexible hours and have school aged children.
- The Japanese Garden currently has 17 permanent members of staff with a further 20 seasonal staff currently employed. Of the permanent members of staff nearly half are from the FK10 postcode district (principally Alloa and Clackmannan).

---

<sup>1</sup> The description of the activities reiterate most of the objectives and are provided to show the additional activities that will be added to the project Benefits Realisation Plan (BRP).

- The [website](#) has been refreshed with prominence given to tourist attractions in Clackmannanshire (including the *Clackmannanshire Tower Trail*). The Japanese Garden will work with CRD stakeholders to support online promotion opportunities/
- The ratio of benefits to public costs over 15 years was initially projected to be 5.9. The latest project data suggests the project is on track to deliver this return and may deliver a higher return.

## New objectives

1a The Japanese Garden will pay the living wage to employees (as set out in the business case).

2a Contractors and those organising placements at the Japanese Garden will agree to pay the living wage.

3a The Japanese Garden will maintain at least half of all employment opportunities for females throughout the ten years of the CRD.

4a At least 90% of the value of capital investment, and ongoing maintenance, will be delivered by local (city region) contractors and continue to encourage contractors to deliver community benefits.

5a The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities<sup>2</sup> (including Alloa South and East) with one in five (20%) employment opportunities benefitting those from deprived communities.

6a A schools engagement programme will be maintained throughout the project to offer pupils an opportunity to visit and engage with the Japanese Garden.

7a In addition to the city region tourism promotion opportunities set out in the business case, the Japanese Garden will promote city region destinations (for example, Alloa Tower and Stirling Castle) using on-site displays and the Japanese Garden website.

---

<sup>2</sup> These areas will be identified by the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD). This includes communities among the 20% most deprived areas in Scotland in terms of multiple deprivation or those among the 20% most deprived areas in Scotland facing specific deprivation issues (including income and employment deprivation).

8a The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.



## New activities

1b The Japanese Garden will pay the living wage to employees.

2b The Japanese Garden will ask contractors and those organising placements to pay the living wage.

3b At the outset of the project half of all employees were female and the Japanese Garden will seek to maintain at least half of all employment opportunities for females throughout the ten years of the CRD.

4b The project capital investment will use local (city-region) contractors where possible. Contractors will be asked to deliver community benefits where possible including providing employment and training opportunities.

5b The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities\* (including Alloa South and East) in partnership with Clackmannanshire Works and other organisations.

6b A Schools engagement programme will be maintained throughout the project to offer pupils an opportunity to visit and engage with the Japanese Garden.

7b The Japanese Garden will promote city region destinations (Alloa Tower, Stirling Castle) using on-site displays and the Japanese Garden website.

8b The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.

## All Project Objectives linked to CRD Strategic Outcomes

The links between all project objectives (including the new objectives) are summarised below linked to each of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal (CRD) strategic outcomes; shared prosperity, higher value jobs, inclusive economic growth and an inclusive skills ecosystem.

## CRD Strategic Outcome: Sharing Prosperity

### Japanese Garden Benefits realisation plan (from business case)

Objectives: (1) Sustain at least 30 employment opportunities each year (including seasonal workers) (2) The Tea House will be restored, recreating the Garden's original boathouse (2) Provides a unique cultural and historical asset to be leveraged by organisations across the city region (3) The project will provide additional visitor capacity for the Garden.

Activities: (1) Secure at least 25,000 visits each year (2) Improved routes and facilities maintain tranquil atmosphere while accommodating more visitors (3) At least half of all visitors to the Japanese Garden will engage with interactive displays and events (4) Maintain 70 active regional partnerships (to raise the profile of the region) (5) Hold at least 10 special events each year (at least 5 of which during the off-season (Sep-May)).

### Additional objectives and activities:

Objectives:

2a Contractors and those organising placements at the Japanese Garden will agree to pay the living wage.

4a At least 90% of the value of capital investment, and ongoing maintenance, will be delivered by local (city region) contractors and continue to encourage contractors to deliver community benefits.

5a The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities (including Alloa South and East) with one in five (20%) employment opportunities benefitting those from deprived communities.

7a In addition to the city region tourism promotion opportunities set out in the business case, the Japanese Garden will promote city region destinations (for example, Alloa Tower and Stirling Castle) using on-site displays and the Japanese Garden website.

8a The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.

Activities:

2b The Japanese Garden will ask contractors and those organising placements to pay the living wage.

4b The project capital investment will use local (city-region) contractors where possible. Contractors will be asked to deliver community benefits where possible including providing employment and training opportunities.

5b The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities\* (including Alloa South and East) in partnership with Clackmannanshire Works and other organisations.

7b The Japanese Garden will promote city region destinations (Alloa Tower, Stirling Castle) using on-site displays and the Japanese Garden website.

8b The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.

## CRD Strategic Outcome: Higher Value Jobs

### **Japanese Garden Benefits realisation plan** (from business case)

Objectives: (1) Provide at least 500 volunteering, learning and work experience opportunities each year

Activities: (1) All volunteering, learning and work experience opportunities will be reviewed on an annual basis with City Region Deal partners (2) Secure 1,200 volunteer hours each year.

### **Additional objectives and activities:**

Objectives:

1a The Japanese Garden will pay the living wage to employees (as set out in the business case).

2a Contractors and those organising placements at the Japanese Garden will agree to pay the living wage.

Activities:

1b The Japanese Garden will pay the living wage to employees.

2b The Japanese Garden will ask contractors and those organising placements to pay the living wage.

## CRD Strategic Outcome: Inclusive Economic Growth

### Japanese Garden Benefits realisation plan (from business case)

Objectives: (1) Provide at least 500 volunteering, learning and work experience opportunities each year (2) All employment opportunities considered within the shared prosperity agenda and inclusive skills ecosystem.

Activities: (1) All volunteering, learning and work experience opportunities will be reviewed on an annual basis with City Region Deal partners (2) Secure 1,200 volunteer hours each year (3) All employment opportunities will be considered for people on a journey to employment and promoting opportunities for underrepresented groups

### Additional objectives and activities:

Objectives:

3a The Japanese Garden will maintain at least half of all employment opportunities for females throughout the ten years of the CRD.

4a At least 90% of the value of capital investment, and ongoing maintenance, will be delivered by local (city region) contractors and continue to encourage contractors to deliver community benefits.

5a The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities (including Alloa South and East) with one in five (20%) employment opportunities benefitting those from deprived communities.

Activities:

3b At the outset of the project half of all employees were female and the Japanese Garden will seek to maintain at least half of all employment opportunities for females throughout the ten years of the CRD.

4b The project capital investment will use local (city-region) contractors where possible. Contractors will be asked to deliver community benefits where possible including providing employment and training opportunities.

5b The Japanese Garden will promote employment opportunities for those living in deprived communities\* (including Alloa South and East) in partnership with Clackmannanshire Works and other organisations.

## CRD Strategic Outcome: Inclusive Skills Ecosystem

### **Japanese Garden Benefits realisation plan** (from business case)

Objectives: (1) All employment opportunities considered within the shared prosperity agenda and inclusive skills ecosystem (2) Buildings and facilities will be developed with most building materials from sustainable sources from within Scotland.

Activities: (1) All employment opportunities will be considered for people on a journey to employment and promoting opportunities for underrepresented groups.

### **Additional objectives and activities:**

Objectives:

6a A schools engagement programme will be maintained throughout the project to offer pupils an opportunity to visit and engage with the Japanese Garden.

8a The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.

Activities:

6b A Schools engagement programme will be maintained throughout the project to offer pupils an opportunity to visit and engage with the Japanese Garden.

8b The Japanese Garden will co-ordinate activities with other projects (after they are selected) within the City Region Deal's Culture, Heritage and Tourism programme (expected to be finalised later this year, 2022) to leverage wider opportunities for the city region.